

NORTHVILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

September 20, 2006

Wednesday 7:00 P.M. – Approved

Northville City Hall -Council Chamber

1. CALL TO ORDER: Mayor Johnson called the Historic District Commission meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

2. ROLL CALL:

Present: Bayly, Coponen, Culp, Gudritz, Holleman, Rodgers and Johnson.

Excused: None.

Also Present: Richard Starling – Building Official

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS: Limited to brief comments for items not on the agenda.

4. MINUTES: June 21, 2006

Motion by Culp, supported by Gudritz to approve the June 21, 2006 minutes as amended. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

5. REPORTS:

A. City Administration: None.

B. City Council: None.

C. Historic District Commission: None.

D. Other Community / Governmental Liaisons: None.

6. CASES:

CASE #1

John & Vicky Lange
229 High Street
Northville, Michigan 48167

WINDOWS

Mike Jelso, representing the Langes, explained the plans to replace seven windows on the house; four in the front and three on the south side. The seven Weather Shield, wood, double hung windows with Low-E / Argon glass are custom made to fit into the original spaces. The windows are white aluminum clad.

Motion by Holleman, supported by Coponen to accept the application for completeness. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

Motion by Holleman, supported by Gudritz to grant a motion to proceed. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

CASE #2

Clean - A – Rama
123 E. Dunlap Street
Northville, Michigan 48167

**BUILDING
REFACING**

The owner of Clean – A – Rama stated that he wishes to reface the existing white vinyl siding on the building with new Quarry Ridge Stone. The selected stone is Cobblestone- and the color is Chardonnay. The white vinyl is out dated and the new cobblestone will match the existing brick.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

- The mixture of the existing brick and the new stone seems strange. The two textures will compete.

COMMISSIONER SUGGESTIONS:

- Investigate using either cement siding or Hardi - plank which can be painted or a brick veneer.

Motion by Holleman, supported by Gudritz to refer the application back to the applicant pending the applicant’s review of using either Hardi - plank or cement siding.
Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

CASE #3

Tim Burns
433 Dubuar
Northville, Michigan 48167

DEMOLITION

Tim Burns the architect for a proposed home at 433 Dubuar explained the plans for the demolition of the 684 sq.ft. home. The structure is in poor condition and in need of a number of repairs and replacements.

Grounds for Demolition: *Retaining the resource is not in the interest of the majority of the community.* He listed the following conditions:

1. The thirty plus year furnace, humidifier and air conditioning system need replacing.
2. The 60 watt fuse electrical service needs replacing.
3. The Plumbing system including the main water and sewer line need replacing.
4. Foundation and chimney need replacement.
5. Roof and roof deck need repair and replacement.
6. Gutters have been removed and need to be replaced.
7. Windows need replacement or total restoration. They leak water and snow.
8. The siding is damaged and decaying. The rafters, trusses, wall studs and fascia lumber require repair or replacement.
9. Exterior painting and caulking is required.
10. The kitchen and appliances need replacement.
11. Bathroom and bath fixtures need replacement and/or repair.
12. Basement stairway needs replacement.

NOTE: There is a strong possibility of mold and structural problems in the building.

The above items require either repair/and or replacement far exceed the value of the house. This has limited the sale of the property. The current owner will not see a reasonable financial return on this building if these needed replacements and or repairs are made. Photos were enclosed of both the interior and exterior of the building.

A letter from eleven neighbors was submitted in favor of the proposal and demolition. (The letter with signatures was actually submitted to the BZA in favor of a request for the 2' variance for a non-conforming lot.) The variance was granted by the BZA on 9-6-2006.

Applicant Comments:

- When a house this small is saved or preserved and added on to, the existing house generally gets buried in the massing of the new home.

Owner Comments: Stephanie and Jason Ruitter

- The owner stated she can't sell the house as is, can't live in it as is, and can't afford to repair it. The home has been for sale for at least a year and there is just no market interest.
- Jason Ruitter asked what value or interest to the community is there when the house sits vacant and continues to deteriorate. We can not afford to rehabilitate it

Resident Comments:

- Robert Sochacki – 223 Linden – stated this is a neat house and should not be demolished. The Historic integrity of the neighborhood should be maintained. Of the ten homes on Dubuar Street, three homes already are not historic. If this one is demolished and the one across the street is demolished more than half of the block will be non historic.
- Dave Creedon – 335 Linden Street – stated that the Commission needs to adhere to the Historic District Guidelines. If allowed to build, the lot will be overbuilt.
- William Dunphy – 440 Dubuar – stated he is also bothered by what builders are allowed to do. The relationship between the new houses on Linden Court and Dubuar are not correct. He signed the BZA petition in favor of the 2' variance which gives Ms Ruitter the ability to sell the lot.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS and CONCERNS:

- The intent of the Historic District Commission is to preserve history.
- The existing home could be added on to in an appropriate size or renovated and added to in the rear yard.
- The focus of this application seems to be to build a new home; one for profit.
- The historical integrity has not been mentioned in the presentation.
- A letter from the Northville Historical Society was referenced. The house was a “common” mid nineteen hundred, folk art home; one in which a couple would add on to as the family grew.
- This is an example of the “Aspen Colorado Syndrome” in which the applicant wishes to purchase the house (for the value of the land) and then demolish it only to rebuild at a much larger scale.

- The application for the demolition is complete, but the criteria for demolition have not been met. The following must be submitted: A structural report from a licensed builder, report reviewing the structural integrity of the building, as well as, a report of alternatives for the building. These could include adding on to the existing house or moving the house to another location.

Motion by Culp, supported by Bayly to accept the application for completeness.

Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Holleman, supported by Gudritz to deny the application for demolition.

Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

CASE #4

WINDOWS & ROOF

Brett & Carol Wheatley
536 West Main Street
Northville, Michigan 48167

Mr. Wheatley described plans to change the east windows (part of a 1996 addition to the home) replicating those at the front of the home. Reconstruct the roof at the rear entry and create a new back porch. This includes changing out the rear (east elevation) door with its two side lights and replacing it with one door with ten panes of glass. The window wall will be replaced with French doors.

Motion by Culp, supported by Holleman to accept the application for completeness.

Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Rodgers, supported by Gudritz to grant a motion to proceed with the revised drawings. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

CASE #5

SIGN

Connektiv Companies
335 East Street
Northville, Michigan 48167

The representative from Signs by Tomorrow described the temporary pre – construction sign for the new development - Corner House located at the northwest corner of Griswold and Cady Streets. The sign which has already been installed depicts what “is coming” and is designed to instill interest in the project.

Details of the Sign:

- Sign Face – 48” x 60”
- Ground to top of sign – 110”
- Ground to top of pole – 120”
- Ground to bottom of pole – 30”
- Total Square footage – 20 sq. ft.
- Board sub straight = alumilite .25 thick, aluminum, 2 sided with a plastic core. (A sample was for review).
- Pole = 4x4 painted (black) with gold toppers.

- White vinyl lettering is on the left of the sign while the photo is on the right.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS and CONCERNS:

- The sign conforms to the Northville’s Sign Ordinance.
- The sign has a time limit placed on it.

Motion by Bayly, supported by Culp to accept the application for completeness.

Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Culp, supported by Holleman to grant a motion to proceed. *Voice Vote:*

Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

CASE #6

WITHDREW

NEW HOUSE

J. Jeffrey Vos
430 Dubuar Street
Northville, Michigan 48167

Applicant withdrew from the agenda, but will re submit for the October, 2006 meeting.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

- The demolition for the existing home at 430 Dubuar was very specific and contingent upon the original set of plans which were previously submitted.

CASE #7

GARAGE

Randy Dickinson
633 Natalie Lane
Northville, Michigan 48167

Randy Dickinson explained that apparently the height of the garage at 633 Natalie Lane is too tall. He stated that he will lower it to be 14’ at the mean height. At this point the front garage windows would be affected. Mr. Dickinson stated that the plans would be altered and all would work out.

After some discussion, the Commissioners decided that the application and the details of the front window, should be reviewed by way of a sub committee, consisting of Rodgers, Coponen and Culp.

Motion by Gudritz, supported by Holleman to refer the application to a subcommittee consisting of Commissioners Culp, Coponen and Rodgers. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

CASE #8

FENCE

Mark Pastula
227 N. Rogers
Northville, Michigan 48167

Mark Pastula explained plans to replace and add to an existing fence with period fencing

materials according to current City of Northville Building codes and ordinances. The fence will be replaced in the same location as of the existing fence line (part which was removed by the neighbors) and will tie into the existing fence. Materials will be pressured treated wood. The style is gothic picket.

Motion by Culp, supported by Coponen to accept the application for completeness.

Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Holleman, supported by Rodgers to grant a motion to proceed. *Voice Vote:*

Yeas. All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

CASE #9

RENOVATION

Mr. & Mrs. David Arndt/ Coponen
116 High Street
Northville, Michigan 48137

Commissioner Coponen asked to be excused from the discussion regarding the renovation of the Arndt's home because of his involvement in the project.

Motion by Gudritz, supported by Rodgers to excuse Commissioner Coponen from

Case #9 because of his involvement in the renovation. *Voice Vote Yeas: All. Nays: None.*

Motion Unanimously Carried.

Walt Coponen, the architect for the project described the plans for the renovation. The home will be reroofed, resided and retrimmed. A 400 square foot addition will be added to the rear of the home to allow for a master bedroom and bath. The garage will be expanded to that of two cars. The addition will maintain the Arts and Crafts bungalow style of the home with the truncated columns. The old aluminum windows will be replaced with new wood windows. The siding for the home will be a light yellow, as well as the window trim.

Motion by Culp, supported by Rodgers to accept the application for completeness.

Voice Vote: Yeas. All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Culp, supported by Gudritz to grant a motion to proceed with the change of the window details. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

CASE # 10

SIGN

Bella Ritz/Graphic Visions
410 E. Main Street
Northville, Michigan 48167

The representative from Graphic Visions described plans to install a sign for Bella Ritz – Puppy Boutique at 410 E. Main Street.

Details of the sign:

- One double sided ground sign.
- Substrate: 2” Signfoam painted Sherwin Williams #7014 Eider White.

- Border: Paintes Sherwin Williams #7019 Gauntlet Grey.
- Text: V-Carved & Painted Sherwin Williams # 7019 Gauntlet Grey with SW #6298 Concerto Outline.
- Oval: Painted SW #6295 Demure with SW #7019 Gauntlet Gray Outline.
- “B” V-Carved & Painted SW #6298 Concerto.
- “R” V-Carved & Painted SW # 7019 Gauntlet Gray.
- Posts 4” x 4” Painted SW # 6298 Concerto with 4” Decorative Tops SW Eider White will match the front door.

Motion by Culp, supported by Rodgers to accept the application for completeness. *Voice Vote: Yeas. All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

Motion by Culp, supported by Gudritz to grant a motion to proceed. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

CASE #11

PORCH

Scott & Terri Denhoff
401 W. Dunlap
Northville, Michigan 48167

Terri Denhoff reported the plans to repair and restore the side porch, replace the header, two posts and add a railing.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

- Dimensions and drawings of the additions and repairs; showing the height, width etc. need to be submitted.

Motion by Culp, supported by Holleman to refer the application to a sub-committee consisting of Commissioners Coponen and Bayly. *Voice Vote: Yeas. All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

7. DISCUSSION:

CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT – HISTORIC PRESERVATION

Historic District Boundaries – City Council has appointed the Historic District Commission to study Northville’s Historic District boundaries, and take appropriate action to prepare a report and recommendation on desired boundary location.

Tim Davis, a Study Consultant for the City’s Finance Department referenced a memo dated 9-20-2006 regarding: **Application for Certified Local Government Status.**

He reported that grant funds and other resources are available to assist the City and related non-profit organizations in obtaining funding for historic preservation projects. The first step in the process to be eligible for these resources is to become a Certified Local Government (CLG). At the 8-15-2005 Council authorized staff to apply for CLG status. Staff would like to update the HDC on this process.

Copies of the Historic District Ordinance, Design Guidelines and procedural rules will be submitted with the application. The Commission's involvement is beneficial for the City's application. The basic requirements and the City's goals were included on page five of the memo.

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOUNDARIES

Mayor Johnson reported that the language of the Historic District Boundaries needs to be changed to wording which reflects properties are either in or out of the district boundaries. The wording currently reflects a grey area for the boundaries of those properties within 200' of the Historic District line.

Motion by Rodgers, supported by Gudritz to direct City Staff prepare the appropriate report to define the Historic District Boundary such that properties are either "in" or "out" of the District. *Voice Vote: Yeas: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

QUORUM

Commissioner Culp asked that the Commission look at the idea of adding two more members to the Commission or to have two new members sit in on the discussion. Because of the two recent summer meetings and not having a quorum, something needs to be done.

Mayor Johnson replied that he will ask the City Manager for the City's Attorney opinion if this idea is appropriate under statute. A reminder to all Commissioners is to notify Shari Allen in the Building Department as soon as you know you will not be available for a meeting.

PREVIOUS CASES:

Three cases were resolved by a subcommittee.

1. 100 West Main – Fence Deck and Awning were approved by a sub committee consisting of Rodgers, Johnson and Bayly.
2. 116 South Rodgers – was asked to change the look to that of the front of the house. The work had already been finished.
3. 220 N. Wing Street was referred back to the next meeting.

8. ADJOURNMENT:

Motion by Rodgers, supported by Gudritz to adjourn the meeting at 9:30 PM. *Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.*

Respectfully submitted,

P. S. Howard
Recording Secretary