

From: Elaine Robinson
To: [Dianne Massa](#)
Subject: FW: Northville Reports
Date: Friday, September 28, 2018 1:39:13 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image008.png](#)
[image009.png](#)
[image010.png](#)
[image011.png](#)
[image002.png](#)

First of two email messages from SHPO to Commonwealth regarding building status.

Elaine

Elaine H. Robinson, Senior Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130
p: (517) 262-3502
e: ehrobinson@chg-inc.com

From: Kolokithas, Kathrine (MSHDA) <KolokithasK1@michigan.gov>
Sent: Friday, September 7, 2018 2:09 PM
To: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>; Walsh, Todd (MSHDA) <WalshT@michigan.gov>; Arnold, Amy (MSHDA) <ARNOLDA@michigan.gov>; Letts, Joelle (MSHDA) <LettsJ1@michigan.gov>
Cc: Brandon Gabler <bgabler@chg-inc.com>; Katie Remensnyder <kremensnyder@chg-inc.com>; Scott Slagor <sslagor@chg-inc.com>
Subject: RE: Northville Reports

Elaine,

Here are our determinations from our meetings the last few days. The bolded red addresses are the ones where we disagree with the nomination and I have provided our explanation below.

Contributing: 473 W. Cady, 494 W. Cady, 504 W. Cady, 206 W. Dunlap, 211 W. Dunlap, 217 W. Dunlap, 412 W. Dunlap, 417 W. Dunlap, 504 W. Dunlap, 527 W. Dunlap, 543 W. Dunlap, 549 W. Dunlap, 552 W. Dunlap, 116 High, 223 High, 115 Linden, 306 W. Main, 521/523/530/531 W. Main, **536 W. Main**, 542 W. Main, 317 Randolph, 503 Randolph, 562 Randolph, 231 N. Rogers, 359 N. Rogers, 365 N. Rogers, 120 West, 226 West, 231 West, 129 N. Wing

Non-Contributing: 495 W. Cady, 419 Dubuar, **446 Dubuar**, **115 E. Dunlap**, **534 W. Dunlap**, **320 High**, **520 W. Main**, 537 W. Main, **113 Randolph**, **124 Randolph**, **572 Randolph**, **227 N Rogers**, 146 S.

Rogers

536 W. Main – this house is not altered more than the overs around it (521-531 W. Main) and should be listed as contributing

446 Dubuar – The addition of a third story on this house substantially alters its original appearance, proportions, and massing; this should be NC

115 E. Dunlap – The absence of the block screen wall and other details remove all decorative elements to this structure and it should be NC

534 W. Dunlap – This house's form and massing has been substantially altered with the addition of a second story over the wing and the addition at the rear

320 High – The addition of the porch and the unknown origins of this house, plus the lack of information regarding its move indicate that it should be NC

520 W. Main – there is not sufficient historic fabric remaining to allow this building to be NC

113 Randolph – The addition completely alters the footprint, massing and size of this house and is particularly visible from the street.

124 Randolph – Large side and rear additions dwarf the original structure and are not easily distinguishable.

572 Randolph – Without more information regarding the original architecture, this structure should be listed as NC based on the additions/alterations

227 N. Rogers – Based on the movement of this house and the large addition it should be NC

Other notes:

589 Randolph doesn't show up in the inventory but we believe it would be NC if it's supposed to be included.

228 West – the report currently says contributing but it should be non-contributing

Let us know if you have any questions on this. As we mentioned on the phone, this is a tricky case since almost none of the additions on these houses meets the standards. Amy will be addressing that in the future with the city as a part of their CLG status/evaluation.

Katie Kolokithas

Survey and Information Coordinator

Michigan State Historic Preservation Office

Michigan State Housing Development Authority

Ph 517.241.6062 fx 517.335.0348

From: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>

Sent: Wednesday, August 29, 2018 5:05 PM

To: Walsh, Todd (MSHDA) <WalshT@michigan.gov>; Arnold, Amy (MSHDA) <ARNOLDA@michigan.gov>; Kolokithas, Kathrine (MSHDA) <KolokithasK1@michigan.gov>; Letts, Joelle (MSHDA) <LettsJ1@michigan.gov>

Cc: Brandon Gabler <bgabler@chg-inc.com>; Katie Remensnyder <kremensnyder@chg-inc.com>; Scott Slagor <sslagor@chg-inc.com>; Conway, Brian (MSHDA) <CONWAYB1@michigan.gov>

Subject: RE: Northville Reports

Thank you Todd,

This very good to hear, and takes a little pressure off. Earlier today the City of Northville pushed back their presentation to the City Council until September 17th, so that helps a lot too. Having the date of the newspaper announcement will come in handy too so I can reference it in my presentation.

We had been holding on to the second draft of the NRN while we tried to figure out if changes were going to be needed. But, we have it ready to go except compiling into a pdf. We will do that, and also provide the Word document to you tomorrow morning.

Thank you again for your assistance with this issue,

Elaine

Elaine H. Robinson, Senior Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130

p: (517) 262-3502

e: ehrobinson@chg-inc.com

From: Walsh, Todd (MSHDA) <WalshT@michigan.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, August 29, 2018 4:51 PM

To: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>; Arnold, Amy (MSHDA) <ARNOLDA@michigan.gov>; Kolokithas, Kathrine (MSHDA) <KolokithasK1@michigan.gov>; Letts, Joelle (MSHDA) <LettsJ1@michigan.gov>

Cc: Brandon Gabler <bgabler@chg-inc.com>; Katie Remensnyder <kremensnyder@chg-inc.com>; Scott Slagor <sslagor@chg-inc.com>; Conway, Brian (MSHDA) <CONWAYB1@michigan.gov>

Subject: RE: Northville Reports

Hello Elaine,

Thank you for sharing your concerns about this project.

Regarding the resource counts, we suggest conveying to the council the number of resources that are settled at this point, and stating that SHPO has yet to review twenty or so resources for which additional information was requested. We (SHPO) could not make determinations for these resources until we received photographs and dates of construction, and all of our relevant staff were available. Now that we have that information we are meeting internally on September 5 to review these resources, and will transmit our determinations to you as soon as possible. That the timeframe has been so compressed and that situations like the above are not uncommon, there is a need to proceed with some degree of flexibility by all parties. Nominations are rarely, if ever, in a "final" form prior to a review board meeting. Indeed, the review board itself could take issue with any aspect of the nomination, thus necessitating a change, and minor edits are often noted at the meeting (for example, Stevie Wonder was noted as the Ambassador of Peach, instead of Peace, in a recent nomination).

We also appreciate your concerns about citizens having a voice in this process. Property owners, citizens, and city officials can submit comments to us prior to the review board meeting and make comments at that meeting on September 14, and at the historic district study committee meeting on September 25. We will also make correction of facts after the review board meeting, prior to submission to NPS. It is also worth noting that we published a newspaper notice in the August 16, 2018, issue of the Northville Record. That notice spells out the results of listing in the National Register, encourages property owners to provide comments, and lays out the steps required when an owner of property in the district objects to the listing. It is also important to remember that nominations are not static. They can be amended at any time. Were a building to be determined non-contributing, and later found to be contributing, we can amend the nomination, much like we are doing with this project, though hopefully not on that scale.

Speaking of draft NR nominations, please submit Draft 2 as soon as possible. We assume you might have been waiting for our determinations. If so, we suggest submitting that without waiting for us so that we may transmit the nomination to the review board prior to the meeting, and to give them time to review it. We will lay out similar caveats as noted above.

Sincerely,

Todd Walsh

Todd A. Walsh, National Register Coordinator
Michigan State Historic Preservation Office
Michigan State Housing Development Authority
735 East Michigan Avenue
PO Box 30044
Lansing, Michigan 48909
www.michigan.gov/shpo

From: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>

Sent: Tuesday, August 28, 2018 3:25 PM

To: Walsh, Todd (MSHDA) <WalshT@michigan.gov>; Arnold, Amy (MSHDA) <ARNOLDA@michigan.gov>; Kolokithas, Kathrine (MSHDA) <KolokithasK1@michigan.gov>; Letts, Joelle (MSHDA) <LettsJ1@michigan.gov>

Cc: Brandon Gabler <bgabler@chg-inc.com>; Katie Remensnyder <kremensnyder@chg-inc.com>; Scott Slagor <sslagor@chg-inc.com>; Conway, Brian (MSHDA) <CONWAYB1@michigan.gov>

Subject: Northville Reports

Importance: High

Hello Todd (and SHPO Team),

We are getting requests from the City of Northville regarding the timing of some of the reporting that has to happen for the large historic district project. Because the timeline has been compressed, we are potentially doing a presentation for the Northville City Council without a draft NR nomination that accurately represents contributing and not-contributing resources in the recommended district.

Todd, it is our understanding that because this is most urgently a matter of the NR, you need to provide guidance for us so that the Survey Report, Study Report, and NR nomination match. With the scheduled City Council presentation on September 4, I need to present the draft version of the nomination and will have to clearly indicate that the counts of contributing and non-contributing resources could change.

One problem is that we are not going to be able to provide an opportunity for the city residents to comment on a nomination that could impact their property. Is there any way that we can get your comments on this issue by the end of this week so we can try and present an accurate document?

Another, possibly better option, would to be able to change the schedule for the reporting so that residents would have a voice in this process.

Please let me know how to proceed at your earliest convenience,

Elaine



Elaine H. Robinson, Senior Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130

p: (517) 262-3502

e: ehrobinson@chg-inc.com

commonwealthheritagegroup.com



From: Elaine Robinson
To: [Dianne Massa](#)
Subject: FW: 534 W. Dunlap Northville MI
Date: Friday, September 28, 2018 1:39:57 PM

Second email from SHPO.

Elaine H. Robinson, Senior Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130

p: (517) 262-3502

e: ehrobinson@chg-inc.com

From: Arnold, Amy (MSHDA) <ARNOLDA@michigan.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, September 26, 2018 2:10 PM

To: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>

Cc: Letts, Joelle (MSHDA) <LettsJ1@michigan.gov>

Subject: RE: 534 W. Dunlap Northville MI

We agree with your reassessment that the house at 534 W Dunlap should be contributing.

From: Elaine Robinson [<mailto:ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>]

Sent: Wednesday, September 26, 2018 9:15 AM

To: Arnold, Amy (MSHDA) <ARNOLDA@michigan.gov>

Cc: Katie Remensnyder <kremensnyder@chg-inc.com>

Subject: FW: 534 W. Dunlap Northville MI

Hello again,

One of the property owners I talked to last night disputed our recommendation of noncontributing for his home at 534 W Dunlap. Given his additional information on materials, I'm inclined to reverse our recommendation about its status to make it contributing. It is located in the center of the street, so the rear addition is partially obscured (this is language we have used for other buildings in the district). However, the differences in the new and historic portions of the building are very slight, so I am hoping you can help guide the recommendation. Photos of the house are attached for your convenience.

Thanks!

Elaine

Elaine H. Robinson, Senior Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130

p: (517) 262-3502

e: ehrobinson@chg-inc.com

From: Katie Remensnyder

Sent: Wednesday, September 26, 2018 8:55 AM

To: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>

Subject: RE: 534 W. Dunlap Northville MI

Photos of the house in question. Still not sure about contributing or not (one of these fun ones)

Katie Remensnyder, Editor/Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130

p: (517) 262-9484

e: kremensnyder@chg-inc.com

From: Elaine Robinson

Sent: Wednesday, September 26, 2018 8:51 AM

To: Katie Remensnyder <kremensnyder@chg-inc.com>

Subject: FW: 534 W. Dunlap Northville MI

Katie,

Here is the additional information on the house the owner discussed with me last night. If this changes your opinion about C/NC please let me know.

Thanks,

Elaine

Elaine H. Robinson, Senior Architectural Historian

3215 Central Street, Dexter, MI 48130

p: (517) 262-3502

e: ehrobinson@chg-inc.com

From: Michael Yurgalite <myurgalite@continentalconstructionllc.net>

Sent: Tuesday, September 25, 2018 10:12 PM

To: Elaine Robinson <ehrobinson@chg-inc.com>

Cc: bower@mhpn.org

Subject: 534 W. Dunlap Northville MI

Elaine,

I'm contacting you regarding the historical study conducted in Northville and specifically regarding my house and it being shown as non-contributing. Some of the information in the report is incorrect, specifically: the siding is shown as composite. It is not. It is A grade cedar siding as was used in 1880, painted the original colors. I also took the roof back to the original cedar shingles. Secondly, there is mention of a 2 story rear addition being placed over an existing one story addition. That is not the case. There is also mention of not being able to distinguish the original house from the addition. That line is clearly visible in both mass and style. The front and both side elevations of the original house are very close to the way it was built. The addition is offset, has a different roof line and casement windows verses the double hung windows on the original. The comment about the mass is surely true, the line about the workmanship is not. (that seemed to be related to the mistake about the siding)

I don't know if any of this makes any difference relating to the non-contributing issue. I thought that it would be and I know the city would prefer that it was. Does it make any sense to review this?

I want to thank you both for spending time with me as I believe that we have many goals in common.

Mallory, I included you on this Email because I thought that you may be interested. If you are not, sorry for the intrusion.

Michael Yurgalite

c (248) 867-1260

Sr. Project Manager

Continental Construction Management LLC